Armel Moumouni Sanou¹, Assana Cissé¹, Tieba Millogo³, Tani Sagna¹, Dieudonné Tialla¹, Thelmas Williams³, N Talla Nzussouo^{3,4} and Zekiba Tarnagda²*

¹Unité des Maladies à potentiel épidémique, maladies émergentes et zoonoses, Institut de Recherche en Sciences de la Santé (IRSS), Bobo-Dioulasso, Burkina Faso ²Institut Africain de Santé Publique (IASP), Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso ³Influenza Division, U.S. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Atlanta, GA ⁴CTS Global Inc., El Segundo, California, United States

*Corresponding Author: Zekiba Tarnagda, Institut de Recherche en Sciences de la Santé (IRSS), Bobo-Dioulasso, Burkina Faso.

Received: July 29, 2016; Published: October 06, 2016

Abstract

Background: Acute respiratory infections (ARIs) are the leading cause of mortality in children in low and middle income countries. Information about the etiologies of ARIs is crucial for prevention and case management strategies. This systematic review aims to describe the etiologies of ARIs in children < 5 years reported in studies conducted in Sub-Saharan African countries.

Methods: A systematic search was conducted using PubMed, Web of sciences and Google scholar to identify articles published in English or French containing data on the etiology of ARIs. In addition, databases of unpublished literature were screened. The review was limited to studies published from January 2000 to September 2015 and the selection of full-text articles for the final inclusion was done by two of the authors.

Results: Following the review of 78 full - text articles, we found that 29 met the inclusion criteria. The identified studies were conducted in 13 Sub - Saharan African countries from which South Africa with 8/29 (27.6%) studies and Kenya with 5/29 (17.2%) studies. Twenty-four (82.7%) were cross - sectional studies and 27 (93.1%) were hospital-based studies. RT - PCR for viruses and culture for bacteria and fungi were the main diagnostic methods used in the reviewed studies. Respiratory syncytial virus (RSV) (4.0% - 35.0%), parainfluenza viruses (PIV)1 - 4 (0.3% - 75.8%), influenza viruses (0.1% - 29.1%), adenovirus (AdV) (1.0% - 26.0%), rhinovirus (RV) (9.5% - 41.0%), human metapneumovirus (hMPV) (0.5% - 8.0%), *S. pneumoniae* (0.7% - 91.0%), S. aureus (0.9% - 42.9%) and *Klebsiella* spp (1.0% - 42.0%) were the most common pathogens detected in these studies.

Conclusion: To our knowledge, this is the first systematic review on the etiology of ARIs in Sub-Saharan Africa. Our results showed that many pathogens, and most commonly viruses, were associated with ARI cases in children less than five years. Unfortunately, the limited geographical distribution of these data from Sub-Saharan Africa do not allow the majority of countries to develop an efficient strategy of ARIs prevention and treatment.

Keywords: Acute Respiratory Infections; Etiology; Children < 5 years; Systematic review; Sub-Saharan Africa; 2000-2015

Abbreviations: LMIC: Low Middle Income Countries; ARI: Acute Respiratory Infection; ALRI: Acute Lower Respiratory Infection; CAP: Community Acquired Pneumonia; RSV: Respiratory Syncytial Virus; PIV: Parainfluenza Virus; hAdV: Human Adenovirus; hCoV: Human Coronavirus; hMPV: Human Metapneumovirus; hBoV: Human Bocavirus; WuPyV: WU Polyomavirus; KIpyV: KI Polyomavirus; RV: Rhinovirus; LRTI: Lower Respiratory Tract Infection; IFA: Immuno-Fluorescence Assay; PCR: Polymerase Chain Reaction; RT-PCR: Reverse Transcriptase – Polymerase Chain Reaction; EV: Enterovirus; CMV: Cytomegalovirus; hPeV: Human Parechovirus; S. aureus: Staphylo-

coccus aureus; H. influenza: Haemophilus influenza ; P. jirovecii: Pneumocystis jirovecii ; M. pneumoniae: Mycoplasma pneumoniae ; C. pneumoniae: Chlamydia pneumoniae ; P. aeruginosa: Pseudomonas aeruginosa; M. tuberculosis: Mycobacterium tuberculosis; DRC: Democratic Republic of Congo; PVC: Pneumococcal Vaccine Conjugate

Introduction

In low and middle income countries (LMICs), acute respiratory infections (ARIs) are a major cause of morbidity and mortality among children less than five years of age. Indeed, it is estimated that about 126 – 156 million cases of acute lower respiratory infections (ALRI) such as pneumonia and bronchiolitis occur worldwide each year in children leading to approximately 1.4 million deaths. More than 95% of these deaths occur in Africa and in South-East Asia [1-3].

Several pathogens cause ARIs. Especially in children < 5 years, respiratory viruses are more commonly identified than bacteria in ARI cases [4]. This may be explained by the fact that bacterial culture, which is the current standard diagnostic method for respiratory bacteria, has a low sensitivity in patients with community acquired pneumonia (CAP) [5,6]. Respiratory viruses such as respiratory syncytial virus (RSV), influenza viruses (A and B), parainfluenza viruses (PIV1-4), human adenovirus (hAdV) and human coronaviruses OC43 and 229E (hCoV-OC43, hCoV-229E) were initially identified as causes of ARIs [7].

More recently, use of advanced molecular diagnostic techniques, has helped to identify other respiratory viruses associated with ARIs including human metapneumovirus (hMPV) [8], human Boca virus (hBoV) [9], human coronavirus NL63 (hCoV-NL63) [10], human coronavirus HKU1 (hCoV-HKU1) [11], WU and KI polyomaviruses (WUPyV, KIPyV) [12,13]. Moreover, human rhinovirus (RV) is involved in the majority of common colds and often induces lower respiratory tract infections (LRTI) [14]. A better understanding of the range of ARI pathogens is essential for the clinical management of cases and the design of preventive strategies to reduce child morbidity and mortality.

To our knowledge, no recent systematic review was conducted on the etiologies of ARIs in children less than five years of age in sub-Saharan Africa. The present study aimed to summarize published and unpublished literature on the etiology of ARIs in children in sub-Saharan African countries and identify gaps of information in order to improve knowledge on this essential topic. We focused our review on sub-Saharan Africa as epidemiological, socioeconomic, and vaccine policy factors in northern Africa would likely be substantially different [15].

Materials and Methods

Search strategy and selection criteria

We undertook a systematic literature review to identify studies with data on etiology of acute respiratory infections in children less than five years. We conducted searches in PubMed, Web of sciences and Google scholar using combinations of key search terms: "etiology", "acute respiratory infections", "upper respiratory infections", and "lower respiratory infections", "pneumonia", "influenza-like illnesses", "children and Africa". Search was also done in unpublished literature of Burkina Faso. An online search of journals was also performed by examining the reference lists of relevant articles. The search was limited to studies published in English or French, focused on children < 5 years old in sub - Saharan Africa, published between January 1, 2000 to September 30, 2015 and in which the pathogens were identified using Immuno-Fluorescence Assays (IFA), PCR (Polymerase Chain Reactions), viral culture, bacteria culture or a combination of these methods [Table 1]. We excluded studies that reported results from the general population, studies targeting children with chronic respiratory infections and review studies. The initial search was conducted in November 2014 and a second search was performed in early October 2015 looking at studies published from November 2014 to September 2015 to ensure that no recent articles were missed in this review.

Citation: Armel M Sanou., *et al.* "Systematic Review of Articles on Etiologies of Acute Respiratory Infections in Children Aged Less Than Five Years in Sub-Saharan Africa, 2000-2015". *EC Microbiology* 3.6 (2016): 556-571.

Inclusion criteria	Exclusion criteria
Studies published between Jan 1, 2000 and September 30, 2015	Studies that reported results from children with chronic respiratory infection
Studies focused on children younger than 5 years, or data reported separately for this age group	Studies conducted in the general population
Studies published in English or in French	Reviews (studies)
Studies that reported results from sub-Saharan Africa	
Studies with data for laboratory-confirmed cases	
Studies which have been carried out in community or at health facilities	

Table 1: Inclusion and exclusion criteria of the reviewed acute respiratory infection (ARI) studies.

One author screened titles and abstracts using the inclusion and exclusion criteria to identify potential studies with ARI etiology data in children < 5 years old. Two authors reviewed the full text of all potentially relevant studies to determine final inclusion. Any discrepancy was discussed and if necessary, we referred to a 3rd author to reach consensus.

Data extraction

Data were extracted by one author and checked by a second author. Any disagreements were resolved by consensus with a 3rd author. We extracted data using a structured Excel database. We extracted the following information: author's name, country and setting of study, period of the study, study design, target populations, sample size, year of publication, description of symptoms and/or diagnostic criteria, length of follow-up, tested specimens, diagnostic method and pathogens testing.

Data Synthesis

We did not assess the quality of the articles but aimed instead to summarize all those identified. We synthetized data by summarizing the key results of each study. Given the variety of types of studies included in the review, including simple descriptive to analytic studies, we found a synthesis more appropriate than a formal meta - analysis. A table was created that list all the pathogens identified in individual studies along with relevant information on the study: design, population, sample size, location, diagnostic methods and year of publication.

Results

Literature review

The initial database search identified 1690 articles. Seventeen [16] additional articles were identified through manual search of grey literature. After the preliminary screening of titles and abstracts, 75 full -text articles were assessed for eligibility. Of these, 49 were excluded because they did not meet inclusion criteria leaving 26 studies [17-41] with ARI that were included [Figure 1]. A second search was performed to ensure that no recent articles were missed in this review. This search retrieved 74 new articles and 3 of which [42-44] met the inclusion criteria for this study.



Characteristics of articles

The 29 articles reported on a total of 23,539 patients. The sample size ranged from 23 to 8723 ARI patients per study. The included studies were carried out in 13 countries. Eight (8) studies were conducted in South Africa, 5 in Kenya, 3 in Mozambique, 2 in Gambia, Ghana, and Uganda respectively, and 1 each in Burkina Faso, Botswana, Cameroon, Gabon, Nigeria, Senegal and Tanzania.

Twenty-four (82.7%) studies were cross-sectional studies and 5 (17.3%) were case-control studies. There were 27 (93.1%) hospitalbased studies and 2 (6.9%) community - based studies. The study setting was urban in 18 (62.1%) studies, rural in 7 (24.1%) and mixed (rural, semi-rural and urban) in 4 (13.8%) studies.

In 20 (68.9%) studies, the pathogens were identified in respiratory specimens including nasal swab, oropharyngeal swab, nasopharyngeal swab, nasopharyngeal aspirate, induced sputum, tracheal aspirate, Broncho alveolar lavage and lung aspiration. Two studies (6.9%) reported collecting blood and 8 studies (27.6%) reported collecting blood and respiratory specimens.

Respiratory viruses were detected using conventional PCR, real time RT - PCR or multiplex RT - PCR solely or combined with conventional methods such as viral culture and immunofluorescence. Bacteria and fungi were detected by PCR, culture and immunoassay. Study characteristics are summarized in [Table 2].

Diagnostic methods		Multiplex real time RT-PCR	Multiplex RT - PCR		PCR – Culture	Immunofluorescence – Culture	Immunofluorescence	Enzyme Immunoassay (EIA)	RT – PCR, Culture	Culture	Real time RT-PCR, Culture	Culture; multiplex real time RT-PCR; serology
Tested specimens		Nasal swabs	Throat and/or naso- pharyngeal swab		Induced sputum	Induced sputum	Induced sputum	Nasopharyngeal aspirate	Nasopharyngeal aspirate	Blood - Induced sputum	Blood, Nasopharyn- geal and Oropharyn- geal swabs	Blood, induced sputum, serum, oro- pharyngeal swab, nasopharyngeal swab
Clinical presen- tation of tested patients		ILI	ILI		Severe pneumonia	Severe pneumonia	Severe pneumonia	Pneumonia	Pneumonia	Severe pneumonia	SARI	Severe pneumo- nia – Very severe pneumonia
Sample size		810	250		72	60	121	50	157	2973	810	
Age range		0 – 4 years	0 – 4 years		2 - 60 Months	≤ 23 months	2 – 60 months	7 – 30 days	≤ 59 months	2 – 59 months	≤ 59 months	1 - 59 months
Design		Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study		Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Case-control study	Case – control study
Location, Year		Gabon; urban, semi rural and rural; 2010 – 2011	Cameroon; urban, semi- urban and rural; 2009		Kilimanjoaro CMC, Tan- zania; urban; 2003	Nairobi, Kenya; urban; 2002 - 2003	Mulago Hospital, Kam- pala, Uganda; urban; 2001	Kenyatta National Hos- pital, Nairobi, Kenya; urban; 2000	Mbagathi District Hos- pital, Nairobi, Kenya; urban; 2002	Mulago Hospital, Kam- pala, Uganda; urban; 2005 – 2006	Lwak Hospital, Nyanza, Kenya; rural; 2007 – 2010	Kilifi District, Kenya; rural; 2010
	Africa, Central	Lekana-Douki SE., 2014 (38)	Njouom R., 2012 (35)	Africa, Eastern	Uriyo J., 2006 (23)	Bii CC ., 2006 (25)	Bakeera-Kitaka S., 2004 (22)	Were FN., 2002 (20)	Bii CC., 2002 (18)	Nantanda R., 2008 (28)	Feikin DR, 2013 (37)	Hammitt LL <i>et al.</i> , 2012 (34)

560

	munoassay, ulture	orescence	Immu- sscence	re, Immu- nce, RT-PCR	Immu- sscence	RT – PCR	. RT-PCR, ure	real time nventional CR, Immu-
	Enzyme-Im Viral c	Immunoflu	Culture nofluor	Viral Cultu nofluoresce	Culture nofluon	Multiplex	Multipley Cult	Multiplex RT-PCR, Co nested RT-I
	Nasopharyngeal aspirate	Nasopharyngeal aspirate	Blood sample; Tracheal aspirate; nasopharyngeal aspirate.	Tracheal aspirate, bronchoalvealoar lavage	Blood, Induced sputum or Bron- choalveloar lavage, nasopharyngeal aspirate, gastric lavage.	Nasopharyngeal aspirate	Nasopharyngeal aspirate, blood	Nasopharyngeal aspirate
	ALRTI	Severe LRTI	Severe pneumonia	ARTI	Pneumonia	ARI	Pneumonia	ARI
	1288	142	23	1055	151	333	807	610
	≤ 2 years	≤ 59 months	≤ 59 months	13 days - 5 years	2 - 23 months	≤ 12 months	≤ 59 months	≤ 59 months
	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Retrospective cross- sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Case-control study
	Cape Town, South Africa; urban; 1995 – 1996	Soweto, South Africa; urban; 1997 – 1999	Pretoria, South Africa; urban; 1994 – 1995	CWM Children's Hospi- tal, Cape Town, South Africa, urban; 2003 – 2004	CWM Children's Hospi- tal, Cape Town, South Africa; urban; 1998	Manhiça District Hospi- tal, Mozambique; rural; 1999 – 2000	Manhiça District Hospi- tal, Mozambique; rural; 2006 – 2007	Pretoria, South Africa; urban; 2006 – 2007
Africa, Southern	Hussey GD, 2000 (16)	Madhi S., 2002 (19)	Delport SD., 2002 (21)	Smuts H., 2008 (27)	Zar HJ., 2001 (17)	O'Callaghan-Gordo C., 2011 (32)	0'Callaghan-Gor- do., 2011* (33)	Venter M., 2011 (31)

Citation: Armel M Sanou., et al. "Systematic Review of Articles on Etiologies of Acute Respiratory Infections in Children Aged Less Than

Five Years in Sub-Saharan Africa, 2000-2015". EC Microbiology 3.6 (2016): 556-571.

Systematic Review of Articles on Etiologies of Acute Respiratory Infections in Children Aged Less Than Five Years in Sub-Saharan Africa, 2000-2015

Immunofluorescence assay: Nested PCR; Multiplex PCR	Real time Multiplex PCR; Uniplex PCR	Multiplex RT-PCR, Blood Culture		Immunofluorescence, Culture, Multiplex RT-PCR	Culture	RT-PCR, Culture	Real time RT-PCR, Culture	Multiplex RT-PCR, Viral culture	RT-PCR, Immu- nofluorescence, viral culture	Immunofluorescence, Culture
Nasopharyngeal aspirate	Nasopharyngeal swabs	Nasopharyngeal aspirate; Blood samples		Nasopharyngeal aspirate	Blood	Lung aspiration or Pleural fluid aspira- tion	Nasopharyngeal swab; Blood	Nasopharyngeal swabs	Nasopharyngeal aspirate, Lung aspiration	Blood,
ALRTI	Pneumonia	Severe pneumonia		ARTI	Pneumonia	Severe pneumonia	ALRTI	ARI	ARTI	CAP
1460	310	834		209	948	55	128	82	649	419
< 2 years	1 – 23 months	≤ 59 months		0 – 3 years	2 – 60 months	2 – 59 months	≤ 59 months	≤ 59 months	≤ 59 months	≤ 59 months
Hospital based surveillance	Case-control study	Hospital based cross-sectional study		Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Hospital based cross-sectional study	Population based cross-sectional study	Case-control study	Population based cross-sectional study
South Africa; urban; 2000 – 2002	Gaborone, Bostwana; urban; 2012 – 2014;	Manhiça District Hospi- tal, Mozambique; rural; 2006 – 2007;		Ouagadougou, Burkina Faso; urban; 2010 – 2011	Agogo, Ghana; rural; 2007 – 2009	Gambia; rural and urban; 2007 – 2009	Komfo Anokye Hospital, Ghana; urban; 2008	Dielmo-Ndiop, Senegal; rural; 2007	MRC Hospital, Faraja, Gambia; urban; 2005	University College Hos- pital, Ibadan, Nigeria; urban;
Nunes MC., 2014 (42)	Kelly MS., 2015 (44)	Lanaspa M., 2015 (43)	Africa, Western	Ouédraogo S., 2014 (41)	Schwarz NG., 2010 (30)	Howie SRC., 2014 (40)	Kwofie TB., 2012 (36)	Niang MN., 2010 (29)	Weber MW., 2006 (24)	Johnson AW., 2008 (26)

hnson AW., University Collee 008 (26) pital, Ibadan, Ni urban;

Table 2: Bacteria and fungi were detected by PCR, culture and immunoassay.

Systematic Review of Articles on Etiologies of Acute Respiratory Infections in Children Aged Less Than Five Years in Sub-

Saharan Africa, 2000-2015

562

Pathogens detected

Prevalence of viral pathogens

Articles reporting the prevalence of viral pathogens are summarized in [Table 3]. Respiratory viruses were tested for 23 (79.31%) studies. Among 20 providing information on RSV, the prevalence ranged from 4.0% to 35.0%. The majority of studies screened for the presence of RSV infection by using molecular method (RT - PCR). A high RSV prevalence (35.0%) was identified in Botswana among children 1 – 23 months of age with severe pneumonia [44] tested by RT-PCR. In contrast, a low RSV prevalence (4.0%) was identified in South African children hospitalized with acute respiratory tract infections [27] using an indirect immunofluorescence assay.

	RSV	hMPV	PIV	Influenza	hRV	AdV	hCoV	EV	Other viruses
Lanaspa M., 2015 (43)	6.1%	4.8%	3.8%	Influenza A 2.6% Influenza B 2.2%	24.1%	12.6%		2.2%	
Kelly MS., 2015 (44)	35%	6%	PIV1 1% PIV2 1% PIV3 4%	Influenza A 2% Influenza B 1%	hRV A 11% hRV B 2% hRV C 13%	1%			
Nunes MC., 2014 (42)	16.3%	7.4%	4%	Influenza A 4.2%	31.9%	2%	hCoV229E 0.27% hCoV-HKU1 1.5% hCoV-NL63 2.3% hCoV-OC43 6.6%		hBoV 11.9% WUPyV 10.7% KIPyV 6.2%
Lekana-Dou- ki SE, 2014 (38)	13.5%	1.8%	PIV1 3.6% PIV2 2.8% PIV3 7.2%	Influenza A 6.8% Influenza B 5.1%	9.5%	17.5%	hCoV-229E 0.7% hCoV-HKU1 1.2% hCoV-NL63 1.5% hCoV-OC43 4.1%	14.7%	hPeV 0.6%
Feikin DR, 2013 (37)	22%	5.1%	PIV1 1.0% PIV2 3.2% PIV3 6.1%	Influenza A 6.6% Influenza B 1.2%	RV/EnV 50%	16%		RV/EnV 50%	hPeV 1.5%
Niang MN., 2010 (29)	23.6%		3.5%	Influenza A 29.1% Influenza B 12.7% Influenza C 3.7%	14.6%		hCoV-229E 3.7% hCoV-NL63 7.2%		hBoV 1.8%
Cohen C, 2014 (39)	26%	6%	PIV1 2.0% PIV2 1.3% PIV3 6.0%	Influenza 7%	37%	26%		10%	
Hammitt LL, 2012 (34)	26.5%	3.1%	PIV1 1.1% PIV2 0.6% PIV3 5.8% PIV4 1.4%	Influenza A 0.9% Influenza B 0.3% Influenza C 0.4%	22.9%	4.8%	hCoV-229E 2.1% hCoV-NL63 0.5% hCoV-OC43 2.7%		
Venter M, 2011 (31)	30.1%	4.8%	PIV1 1.0% PIV2 1.2% PIV3 7.8%	Influenza A 3.4% Influenza B 1.6%	33%	5.7%	hCoV-229E 0.3% hCoV-HKU1 0.2% hCoV-NL63 2.1% hCoV-OC43 1.8%		
O'Callaghan- Gordo, 2011(32)		7%	PIV1 0.6% PIV2 1.2% PIV3 2.7% PIV4 0.3%	Influenza A 12.3% Influenza B 3.0%	26%			3%	
O'Callaghan- Gordo, 2011* (33)	11%	8%	PIV1 0.6% PIV2 2.1% PIV3 1.5% PIV4 2.3%	Influenza A 4.4% Influenza B 3.8%	41%	21%		4%	

564

Smuts H, 2008 (27)	4%		PIV1 0.57% PIV2 0.38% PIV3 3.0%	Influenza A 0.76% Influenza B 0.09%		6.2%	hCoV-NL63 0.85%		CMV 15.0%
Howie SRC, 2014 (40)	4%.			Influenza C 2%		4%	hCoV-HKU1 2%	2%	hBoV 4%
Ouédraogo S, 2014 (41)	9.1%	0.5%	0.5%	Influenza A 3.8%	35.4%	1%		12.4%	
Weber WM, 2006 (24)	8.47%		6.5%	Influenza A 8% Influenza B 3.7%		9.9%			
Njouom R, 2012 (35)	10.4%		12%	Influenza A 18.4%	25.6%				
Hussey GD, 2000 (16)	16.4%		2.5%	Influenza B 0.6%		3.7%			
Kwofie TB, 2012 (36)	14.1%		7.8%	Influenza B 0.8%		10%			
Johnson AW, 2008 (26)	30.4%		PIV3 19.5%	Influenza A 17.3%					
Bii CC, 2002 (18)	22%		5%			4%			
Madhi SA <i>et al,</i> 2002 (19)			PIV1 22.6% PIV3 75.8%						
Delport SD, 2002 (21)	20.4%								
Zar HJ, 2001 (17)									CMV 14.3%

Table 3: Results of studies reporting prevalence of viral pathogens.

Among 20 studies, the prevalence of PIV was found to be between 0.6% and 22.6% for PIV1, 0.4% and 3.2% for PIV2, 1.5% and 75.8% for PIV3, and 0.3% and 3.2% for PIV4. Three studies reported the prevalence of PIV4 infection and RT-PCR was the most frequent diagnosis method used.

The prevalence of influenza virus infection in 19 studies ranged from 0.8% to 29.1% for influenza A, 0.1% to 12.7% for influenza B and 0.4% to 3.7% for influenza C. Influenza C was detected only in 3 studies and RT-PCR was the main diagnosis technique.

Among 16 studies providing information of the prevalence of AdV infections, the prevalence ranged from 1.0% to 26.0%. Adenoviruses were detected mainly by PCR. Using nasopharyngeal aspirate, a high prevalence (26.0%) was found among children less than five years old hospitalized for LRTI in South Africa [39]. Using nasopharyngeal swab specimens, a low prevalence (1%) was reported in Botswana among children aged from 1 – 23 months who were hospitalized with severe pneumonia [44].

Among 13 studies, the prevalence of rhinovirus infections ranged from 9.5% to 41.0%. One study [44] reported type-specific prevalence of 11% for rhinovirus A, 2% for rhinovirus B (2%) and 13% for rhinovirus C.

)ther pathogens	Enteric bacilli 1.5%		<i>E. coli</i> 18% P. aeruginosa 3%	M. tuberculosis 1.4%	P. aeruginosa 8.2% M. tuberculosis 7.4% M. catarrhalis 2.7%				
Pneumocystis C	P. jirovecii 6.8%		P. jirovecii 13%	P. jirovecii 2.8%	P. carinii 9.9%			P. carinii 16.5%	
Candida spp			C. albicans 45% C.tropicalis 7% C. glabrata 5%						
Salmonella spp	0.8%						S. enteritidis 4.8%		
Klebsiella spp			K. pneumoniae 43%		K. pneumoniae 10.9%		9.5%		
C.pneumoniae						9.4%			51%
M. pneumoniae									
S.aureus	%6.0		13%		15%		42.9%		
H.influenzae	3.4%		3%		8.8%		9.5%		
S.pneumoniae	6.3%	4%	5%	63.9%	1.4%		33.3%		
	Lanaspa M, 2015 (43)	Cohen C, 2014 (39)	Bii CC, 2006 (25)	Uriyo J, 2006 (23)	Zar HJ <i>et al.</i> , 2001 (17)	Weber WM, 2006 (24)	Nantanda R, 2008 (28)	Bakeera- Kitaka S, 2004 (22)	Were FN,

									E. coli 2%
									13%
	S. non typhi 9.3% S. typhi 2.3%					S. non typhi 1.9%			1%
K. pneumoniae 27.73%	Klebsiella spp 1.2%	Klebsiella spp 15.3%		Klebsiella spp 1.5%			K. pneumoniae 30.3%	Klebsiella spp 4%	K. pneumoniae 1%
			0.4%			1.5%			33.7%
	2.9%	37.3%		7.8%	11%		42.4%	6%	3%
					29%	0.1%		23%	
	4.6%	5.1%			29%	0.7%	27.7%	91%	26%
Delport SD, 2002 (21)	Schwarz NG, 2010 (30)	Johnson AW, 2008 (26)	Hammitt LL, 2012 (34)	Kwofie TB, 2012 (36)	0'Callaghan- Gordo C, 2011 (32)	Feikin DR, 2013 (37)	Ouédraogo S, 2014 (41)	Howie SRC, 2014 (40)	Bii CC, 2002 (18)

Г

566

Table 4: Results of studies reporting the prevalence of bacterial and fungal pathogens.

567

The prevalence of hMPV infection ranged from 0.5% to 8.0% (11 studies) and enterovirus (EV) from 2.2% to 14.7% (8 studies). Among 7 studies, the prevalence of human coronavirus (hCoV) infection ranged from 0.3% to 3.7% for hCoV - 229E, 0.2% to 2.0% for hCoV - HKU1, 0.5% to 7.2% for hCoV - NL63 and 1.8% to 6.6% for hCoV - 0C43.

Among less common pathogens, the prevalence was 10.7% for WUPyV (1 study), 6.2% for KIPyV (1 study), 14.3% and 15.0% for cytomegalovirus (CMV) (2 studies), 0.6% and 1.5% for human par echovirus (hPeV) (2 studies) and 1.8% to 11.2% for human Boca virus hBoV (3 studies).

Prevalence of bacteria and fungi pathogens

Articles reporting the prevalence of bacterial and fungal pathogens are summarized in Table 4. Nineteen studies (65.5%) with information about prevalence of bacterial and fungal infections were identified. Thirteen studies reported information on Streptococcus pneumoniae infection prevalence, 11 on Staphylococcus aureus (S. aureus), 10 on Klebsiella spp, 7 on Haemophilus influenza (H. influenza), 5 on Pneumocystis jiroveci (P. jiroveci) and Salmonella spp respectively, 3 on Mycoplasma pneumoniae (M. pneumpniae), and 2 on Chlamydia pneumoniae (C. pneumoniae), Candida spp, Pseudomonas aeruginosa (P. aeruginosa), Mycobacterium tuberculosis (M. tuberculosis), and Escherichia coli (*E. colis*) respectively. The prevalence range of these different pathogens was: S. pneumoniae (0.7% - 91.0%), S. aureus (0.9% - 42.9%), Klebsiella spp (1.0% - 42.9%), H. influenza (0.1% - 29.0%), P. jiroveci (9.9% - 16.5%), Salmonella spp (0.8% - 9.2%), C. pneumoniae (9.4% and 51.0%), Candida spp (13.0% ad 45.0%), P. aeruginosa (3.0% and 8.2%), M. tuberculosis (1.4% and 7.4%) and *E. coli* (2% and 18%). The majority of studies on these pathogens were conducted between 2000 - 2009.

Discussion

To our knowledge, this is the first systematic review of the etiology of ARIs in sub-Saharan Africa. Our study reported that many pathogens were detected in different clinical specimens among children less than five years old with ARIs. RSV, PIV, influenza virus, AdV, hRV, S. pneumoniae, S. aureus and Klebsiella spp were the most frequently detected pathogens. PCR was the diagnostic tool most used in these studies; it improves the diagnostic sensitivity over conventional methods for the detection of pathogens in clinical samples [45] and the use of PCR could explain the increase in the detection of pathogens associated to ARIs as compared to conventional methods. Therefore, the findings of PCR testing in respiratory specimens from non-sterile sites must be interpreted judiciously. The presence of viral and bacterial nucleic acids in these specimens does not necessarily mean that these pathogens caused the ARI symptoms [46,47]. In this case, sampling of healthy controls is needed to assess contribution of various pathogens to clinical symptoms. In our study, only 5 (17.3%) studies used this approach. The results of these studies [24,31,34,37] reveal that RSV, influenza virus and PIV 3 are more frequently identified in ARI cases than in healthy controls. More high quality studies on etiologies of ARIs in children are needed in sub-Saharan African countries.

We found little or no data on the etiology of ARIs in many sub-Saharan Africa countries. Indeed, of the 43 sub-Saharan Africa countries, the 29 studies included in this review were done only in 13 countries and about half of these studies were carried out in only two countries: 8 in South Africa and 5 in Kenya. In addition, our literature review identified only one study in Nigeria and none in Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), both of which are among the 5 countries with the highest burden of child pneumonia deaths in the world [2]. This lack of data could be due in part to a low implementation of research in sub - Saharan African countries.

Also, the majority of these studies were performed before 2010. With the introduction of pneumococcal (PVC) and Haemophilus influenza type b (Hib) conjugate vaccines in many sub-Saharan Africa countries over the last decade [48,49], studies to define the changing epidemiological pattern of pathogens associated with ARIs in children are essential.

Our study has several limitations. First, only publications in the English or French literature were included, excluding for example, data published in Portuguese, which is the official language of five countries (Angola, Cape Verde, Guinea Bissau, Mozambique and Sao Tome and Principe) and Spanish, which is the official language of Equatorial Guinea. Second, the unpublished literature of sub-Saharan coun-

568

tries other than Burkina Faso was not included in this systematic review. Third, we did not assess study quality but included all articles that met our inclusion criteria.



Figure 2: Location of the 29 included studies.

Conclusion

In conclusion, our study revealed that many pathogens mainly viruses are associated with ARIs in children less than five years old. The WHO global strategy to control ARIs in children under five need to account for the importance of non-bacterial cases. The results also highlighted the lack of data in several sub - Saharan Africa countries. Further high quality studies are required to determine the role of viruses and bacteria in childhood ARIs and to define the epidemiology of bacterial ARIs after the introduction of two bacterial conjugate vaccines. Additionally, future systematic reviews should appropriately address the quality of the studies.

Bibliography

- 1. Liu L., *et al.* "Global, regional, and national causes of child mortality: an updated systematic analysis for 2010 with time trends since 2000". *The Lancet* 379.9832 (2012): 2151-2161.
- 2. Nair H., *et al.* "Global and regional burden of hospital admissions for severe acute lower respiratory infections in young children in 2010: a systematic analysis". *The Lancet* 381.9875 (2013): 1380-1390.
- 3. Sonego M., *et al.* "Risk factors for mortality from acute lower respiratory infections (ALRI) in children under five years of age in low and middle-income countries: a systematic review and meta-analysis of observational studies". *PLoS One* 10.1 (2015): e0116380.
- 4. Shabir A., *et al.* "The Impact of a 9-Valent Pneumococcal Conjugate Vaccine on the Public Health Burden of Pneumonia in HIV-Infected and -Uninfected Children". *Clinical infectious diseases: an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America* 40 (2005): 1511-1518.

- 5. Gadsby NJ., *et al.* "Development of two real-time multiplex PCR assays for the detection and quantification of eight key bacterial pathogens in lower respiratory tract infections". *Clinical Microbiology and Infection* 21.8 (2015): 788.e1-788.e13.
- 6. Chalmers DJ., et al. "Epidemiology, Antibiotic Therapy, and Clinical Outcomes in Health Care-Associated Pneumonia: A UK Cohort Study". Clinical infectious diseases: an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America 53.2 (2011): 107-113.
- 7. Tregoning JS., *et al.* "Respiratory viral infections in infants: causes, clinical symptoms, virology, and immunology". *Clinical microbiology reviews* 23.1 (2010): 74-98.
- 8. Bernadette G. Van Den Hoogen., *et al.* "A newly discovered human pneumovirus isolated from young children with respiratory tract disease". *Nature Medecine* 7.6 (2001): 719-724.
- 9. Allander T., *et al.* "Cloning of a human parvovirus by molecular screening of respiratory tract samples". *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 102.36 (2005): 12891-12896.
- 10. Lia van der Hoek KP, et al. "Identification of a new human coronavirus". Nature Medicine 10.4 (2004): 368-373.
- 11. Woo PC., et al. "Clinical and Molecular Epidemiological Features of Coronavirus HKU1–Associated Community-Acquired Pneumonia". The Journal of Infectious Diseases 192.11 (2005): 1898-1907.
- 12. Gaynor AM., *et al.* "Identification of a Novel Polyomavirus from Patients with Acute Respiratory Tract Infections". *PLoS Pathogens* 3.5 (2007): e64.
- 13. Allander T., et al. "Identification of a third human polyomavirus". Journal of virology 81.8 (2007): 4130-4136.
- 14. Pierangeli A., *et al.* "Detection and Typing by Molecular Techniques of Respiratory Viruses in Children Hospitalized for Acute Respiratory Infection in Rome, Italy". *Journal of Medical Virology* 79.4 (2007): 463-468.
- Gessner BD., et al. "Seasonal influenza epidemiology in sub-Saharan Africa: a systematic review". The Lancet Infectious Diseases 11.3 (2011): 223-235.
- 16. Zar HJ, *et al.* "Aetiology and outcome of pneumonia in human immunodeciency virus-infected children hospitalized in South Africa". *Acta Paediatr* 90 (2001): 119-125.
- 17. Hussey GD., *et al.* "Respiratory syncytial virus infection in children hospitalized with acute lower respiratory tract infection". *South African Medical Journal* 90.5 (2000): 509-512.
- 18. Bii CC., *et al.* "Mycoplasma pneumoniae in children with pneumonia at Mbagathi District Hospital, Nairobi". *East African Medical Journal* 79.6 (2002): 317-322.
- 19. Madhi SA., et al. "Severe lower respiratory tract infections associated with human parainfluenza viruses 1-3 in children infected and non-infected with HIV type 1". European journal of clinical microbiology & infectious diseases: official publication of the European Society of Clinical Microbiology 21.7 (2002): 499-505.
- 20. Were FN., *et al.* "Chlamydia as a cause of late neonatal pneumonia at Kenyatta National Hospital, Nairobi". *East African Medical Journal* 79.9 (2002): 476-479.
- 21. Delport SD., *et al.* "Aetiology and outcome of severe community-acquired pneumonia in children admitted to a paediatric intensive care unit". South African Medical Journal 92.11 (2002): 907-911.
- 22. Bakeera-Kitaka S., *et al.* "Pneumocystis carinii in children with severe pneumonia at Mulago Hospital, Uganda". *Annals of Tropical Pediatrics* 24.3 (2004): 227-235.

Citation: Armel M Sanou., *et al.* "Systematic Review of Articles on Etiologies of Acute Respiratory Infections in Children Aged Less Than Five Years in Sub-Saharan Africa, 2000-2015". *EC Microbiology* 3.6 (2016): 556-571.

570

- 23. Uriyo J., *et al.* "Prevalences of Pneumocystis jiroveci, Mycobacterium tuberculosis and Streptococcus pneumoniae infection in children with severe pneumonia, in a tertiary referral hospital in northern Tanzania". *Annals of tropical medicine and parasitology* 100.3 (2006): 245-249.
- 24. Weber WM., *et al.* "The role of Chlamydia pneumoniae in acute respiratory tract infections in young children in The Gambia, West Africa". *Annals of Tropical Pediatrics* 26.2 (2006): 87-94.
- 25. Bii CC., *et al.* "Pneumocystis jirovecii and microbiological findings in children with severe pneumonia in Nairobi, Kenya". *Internation Journal of tuberculosis and Lung Diseases* 10.11 (2006): 1286-1291.
- 26. Johnson AW., *et al.* "Etiologic agents and outcome determinants of community acquired pneumonia in urban children: a hospitalbased study". *Journal of the National Medical Association* 100.4 (2008): 370-385.
- 27. Smuts H. "Human coronavirus NL63 infections in infants hospitalised with acute respiratory tract infections in South Africa". *Influenza and Other Respiratory viruses* 2.4 (2008): 135-138.
- 28. Nantanda R., *et al.* "Bacterial aetiology and outcome in children with severe pneumonia in Uganda". *Annals of tropical pediatrics* 28.4 (2008): 253-260.
- 29. Niang MN., *et al.* "Viral etiology of respiratory infections in children under 5 years old living in tropical rural areas of Senegal: The EVIRA project". *Journal of Medical Virology* 82.5 (2010): 866-872.
- 30. Schwarz NG., *et al.* "Systemic bacteraemia in children presenting with clinical pneumonia and the impact of non-typhoid salmonella (NTS)". *BMC Infectious Diseases*. (2010): 10-319.
- 31. Venter M., *et al.* "Contribution of common and recently described respiratory viruses to annual hospitalizations in children in South Africa". *Journal of Medical Virology* 83.8 (2011): 1458-1468.
- 32. O'Callaghan-Gordo C., *et al.* "Etiology and epidemiology of viral pneumonia among hospitalized children in rural Mozambique: a malaria endemic area with high prevalence of human immunodeficiency virus". *The Pediatric infectious disease journal* 30.1 (2011): 39-44.
- 33. O'Callaghan-Gordo C., *et al.* "Viral acute respiratory infections among infants visited in a rural hospital of southern Mozambique". *Tropical medicine & international health: TM & IH* 16.9 (2011):1054-1060.
- 34. Hammitt LL., *et al.* "A preliminary study of pneumonia etiology among hospitalized children in Kenya". *Clinical infectious diseases: an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America* 54 Suppl 2 (2012): S190-S199.
- 35. Njouom R., *et al.* "Viral Etiology of Influenza-Like Illnesses in Cameroon, January-December 2009". *Journal of Infectious Diseases* 206 Suppl 1 (2012): S29-S35.
- 36. Kwofie TB., *et al.* "Respiratory viruses in children hospitalized for acute lower respiratory tract infection in Ghana". *Virology journal* 9 (2012) :78.
- 37. Feikin DR., *et al.* "Viral and Bacterial Causes of Severe Acute Respiratory Illness Among Children Aged Less Than 5 Years in a High Malaria Prevalence Area of Western Kenya, 2007–2010". *The Pediatric infectious disease journal* 32.1 (2013): e14-e9.
- 38. Lekana-Douki SE., *et al.* "Viral etiology and seasonality of influenza-like illness in Gabon, March 2010 to June 2011". *BMC Infectious Diseases* (2014) 14:373.
- 39. Cohen C., *et al.* "Epidemiology of viral-associated acute lower respiratory tract infection among children < 5 years of age in a high HIV prevalence setting, South Africa, 2009-2012". *The Pediatric infectious disease journal* 34.1 (2015): 66-72.

- 40. Howie SRC., *et al.* "Etiology of Severe Childhood Pneumonia in The Gambia, West Africa, Determined by Conventional and Molecular Microbiological Analyses of Lung and Pleural Aspirate Samples". *Clinical Infectious Diseases* 59.5 (2014): 682-685.
- 41. Ouedraogo S., *et al.* "Viral etiology of respiratory tract infections in children at the pediatric hospital in Ouagadougou (Burkina Faso)". *PLoS One* 9.10 (2014): e110435.
- 42. Nunes MC., *et al.* "Clinical Epidemiology of Bocavirus, Rhinovirus, Two Polyomaviruses and Four Coronaviruses in HIV-Infected and HIV-Uninfected South African Children". *Plos One* 9.2 (2014): e86448.
- 43. Lanaspa M., *et al.* "High prevalence of Pneumocystis jirovecii pneumonia among Mozambican children <5 years of age admitted to hospital with clinical severe pneumonia". *Clinical Microbiology and Infection* 21.11 (2015): e9-e15.
- 44. Kelly MS., *et al.* "Association of Respiratory Viruses with Outcomes of Severe Childhood Pneumonia in Botswana". *Plos One* 10.5 (2015): e0126593.
- 45. Levine OS., *et al.* "The Pneumonia Etiology Research for Child Health Project: a 21st century childhood pneumonia etiology study". *Clinical infectious diseases: an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America* 54 Suppl 2 (2012): S93-S101.
- 46. Ruuskanen O., et al. "Viral pneumonia". The Lancet 377.9773 (2011): 1264-1275.
- 47. Gilani Z., *et al.* "A literature review and survey of childhood pneumonia etiology studies: 2000-2010". *Clinical infectious diseases: an official publication of the Infectious Diseases Society of America* 54 Suppl 2 (2012): S102-8.
- 48. Zar HJ., et al. "Pneumonia in low and middle income countries: progress and challenges". Thorax 68.11 (2013): 1052-1056.
- 49. Zar HJ., et al. "Childhood pneumonia: the role of viruses". Thorax 70.9 (2015): 811-812.

Volume 3 Issue 6 October 2016 © All rights reserved by Armel M Sanou., *et al.*